56

57

58

59

60

## On the elasticity of transverse isotropic soft tissues (L)

Daniel Royer, Jean-Luc Gennisson,<sup>a)</sup> Thomas Deffieux, and Mickaël Tanter Institut Langevin - Ondes et Images, ESPCI ParisTech - CNRS UMR 7587 - INSERM U979 - Université Paris

7, 10, rue Vauquelin, 75231 Paris Cedex 05, France

(Received 6 December 2010; revised 31 January 2011; accepted 1 February 2011)

Quantitative elastography techniques have recently been developed to estimate the shear modulus  $\mu$ of soft tissues in vivo. In the case of isotropic and quasi-incompressible media, the Young's modulus E is close to  $3\mu$ , which is not true in transverse anisotropic tissues such as muscles. In this letter, the transverse isotropic model established for hexagonal crystals is revisited in the case of soft solids. Relationships between elastic constants and Young's moduli are derived and validated on experimental data found in the literature. It is shown that  $3\mu_{\perp} \leq E_{\perp} \leq 4\mu_{\perp}$  and that  $E_{//}$  cannot only be determined from the measurements of  $\mu_{I/I}$  and  $\mu_{\perp} \otimes 2011$  Acoustical Society of America. [DOI: 10.1121/1.3559681]

PACS number(s): 43.80.Qf, 43.80.Vj, 43.80.Ev [OAS]

I. INTRODUCTION

It is now well established that anisotropy plays a major role in the mechanical properties of biological media such as muscles,<sup>1</sup> tendons,<sup>2,3</sup> or bones.<sup>4</sup> Linear elastic theory, first developed for crystals,<sup>5</sup> was applied for modeling the propagation of ultrasonic waves in such media. First experimental results were satisfactorily explained by assuming a transverse isotropy around a specific axis of symmetry.<sup>1,3</sup> Elastic constants of the model were determined from the measurement of speed  $V_L$  of ultrasound (1–10 MHz) for longitudinal waves propagating in various directions. In these studies, shear elastic constants were neglected or assumed to be zero due to the lack of measurement systems. Some years ago, the transient elastography (TE) technique was applied to measure the speed  $V_S$  of low frequency (50–150 Hz) shear waves propagating in soft tissues.<sup>6</sup> Using this technique, local elasticity of soft tissues was obtained from shear velocity measurements and a strong anisotropy was found for shear waves propagating perpendicular or parallel to the muscle fibers.<sup>7</sup> Recently, the supersonic shear imaging (SSI) technique<sup>8</sup> was applied to the measurement of shear wave speed in muscles and confirmed this strong anisotropy.<sup>9</sup> Such experiments allow us to recover the components of the elastic tensor determining the type of anisotropy.

Nevertheless elasticity is most commonly defined in terms of Young's modulus E. In an isotropic elastic soft media (Poisson's ratio  $v \cong 0.5$ ), this parameter can be deduced from the shear velocity measurements by the simple relation  $E \cong 3\mu = 3\rho V_s^2$ , where  $\mu$  is the shear modulus. In transverse isotropic or hexagonal media, similarly to the other components of the elastic tensor, two Young's moduli are defined. However, the relationship between the Young's modulus and the shear velocity is no more so simple. In this paper, the mechanical behavior of transverse isotropic soft tissues is investigated. Relations between components of the stiffness tensor are established and used to interpret experimental data found in the literature. Finally, the unusual behavior of muscles and tendons, compared with that of hexagonal crystals, is also discussed.

Pages: 1-4

## **II. ANALYSIS**

The propagation of ultrasonic waves is governed by 86 the mechanical properties of the propagating medium.<sup>2</sup> 87 Measurements performed on muscles or tendons have 88 shown that the isotropic model, used for many other bio-89 logical tissues, is not valid. The transverse isotropic model 90 developed for materials exhibiting at least a hexagonal or 91 an axial symmetry is more appropriated.<sup>1</sup> Given the Carte-92 sian coordinate  $(x_1, x_2, x_3)$  with the  $x_3$ -axis parallel to the 93 fibers, a muscle or a tendon is isotropic in the  $(x_1, x_2)$ 94 plane. In the linear elastic theory, mechanical properties 95 are described by the stiffness tensor  $c_{ijkl}$  or the compliance 96 tensor  $s_{ijkl}$  (*i*, *j*, *k*, l = 1-3). Using the Voigt's notation, 97 they are represented by  $6 \times 6$  symmetric matrices  $c_{\alpha\beta}$  or  $s_{\alpha\beta}$ 98  $(\alpha, \beta = 1-6)$ . For transverse isotropic media, the number of 99 independent elastic constants reduces to five:  $c_{11}$ ,  $c_{13}$ ,  $c_{33}$ , 100  $c_{44}$ , and  $c_{66}$ . Other elastic constants are related to these 101 coefficients or vanish, 102

$$c_{22} = c_{11}, c_{23} = c_{13}, c_{55} = c_{44}, c_{12} = c_{11} - 2c_{66}.$$
 (1)

The same features can be established for the components of the compliance matrix  $s_{\alpha\beta}$ , inverse of the stiffness matrix  $C_{\alpha\beta}$ .

Stiffness constants  $c_{11}$  and  $c_{33}$  can be determined from the measurement of longitudinal ultrasound velocities in directions perpendicular  $(V_{L1})$  and parallel  $(V_{L3})$  to the fiber axis  $x_3$ ,

$$c_{11} = \rho(V_{L1})^2, \ c_{33} = \rho(V_{L3})^2,$$
 (2)

115 where  $\rho$  is the mass density. The constant  $c_{13}$  can be deduced 116 from the velocity of longitudinal waves propagating in a me-117 ridian plane such as  $(x_1, x_3)$ . Other constants can be obtained 118 with TE technique (Fig. 1) from the velocity ( $V_{S1}$  or  $V_{S3}$ ) of 119 shear waves propagating in a direction perpendicular to the 120

110

111

112

113

114

61

62

63

64

65

66

67

68 69

70

72

74

75

76

77

78

79

80

81

82

83

84

85

0001-4966/2011/129(4)/1/4/\$30.00

© 2011 Acoustical Society of America 1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a)</sup>Author to whom correspondence should be addressed. Electronic mail: jl.gennisson@espci.fr.



FIG. 1. Schematics of the TE technique where a rod mounted on a vibrator gives a low frequency pulse at the surface of the medium generating shear waves. (a) When the rod is perpendicular to the fibers axis, a shear wave propagates  $(\vec{k})$  perpendicularly to the fibers axis with a polarization  $(\vec{u})$  parallel to the fibers axis. (b) When the rod is parallel to the fibers axis, a shear wave propagates  $(\vec{k})$  perpendicularly to the fibers axis with a polarization  $(\vec{u})$ perpendicular to the fibers axis. Such configurations give, respectively, access to the elastic constants  $c_{44}$  and  $c_{66}$ .

fiber axis with a polarization oriented either parallel to the fibers,

$$c_{44} = \rho (V_{S3})^2, \tag{3}$$

or perpendicular to the fibers,

121

122

123

124

125

126

127

128

129

130

131

132

133

134

135

136

137

138

139

140

141

142

143

144

145

146

147

148

165

166 167

168

169

170 171

172

173 174

175

176

177

178

179

180

$$c_{66} = \rho (V_{S1})^2. \tag{4}$$

Regarding SSI technique, as presented in Fig. 2, c<sub>44</sub> is deduced from the velocity of shear waves propagating along the fiber axis and polarized in any direction perpendicular to the fibers.

In the case of soft tissues, like muscle, the order of mag-149 150 nitude of these constants is very different. Longitudinal wave velocity measured at megahertz frequencies are in the 151 kilometer per second range. With  $\rho = 1100 \text{ kg/m}^3$ , values of 152 constants  $c_{11}$ ,  $c_{33}$ , and  $c_{13}$  were on the order of 3 GPa.<sup>1</sup> Con-153 versely, shear velocities were found to be in 1-10 m/s 154 range.<sup>8</sup> Then, values of constants  $c_{66}$  and  $c_{44}$  are on the order 155 of 100 kPa, i.e., more than four orders of magnitude lower 156 than the three other constants. These results obtained 157 recently by TE or SSI justifies the hypothesis made by 158 Levinson<sup>1</sup> that the value of the shear constant  $c_{44}$  remains 159 equal to zero throughout the iterative process used to deter-160 mine the elastic constants from the speed of ultrasound. This 161 author approximates the velocity equation by assuming that 162  $c_{13} \approx \sqrt{c_{11}c_{33}}$ . Moreover, Levinson notes that this initial 163 estimate meets terminal conditions of the optimization 164



FIG. 2. Schematics of the SSI technique where a radiation force perpendicular to the fibers axis generates shear waves. (a) When the ultrasonic probe is parallel to the fibers axis, a shear wave propagates (k) parallel to the fibers axis with a polarization  $(\vec{u})$  perpendicular to the fibers axis. (b) When the ultrasonic probe is perpendicular to the fibers axis, a shear wave propagates  $(\vec{k})$  perpendicularly to the fibers axis with a polarization  $(\vec{u})$  perpendicular to the fibers axis. Such configurations give, respectively, access to the elastic constants  $c_{44}$  and  $c_{66}$ .

algorithm. In the following, this relation is demonstrated and a more general relation between elastic constants is established, which is valid in the case of tendon where the shear stiffness  $c_{66}$  cannot be neglected.<sup>3</sup>

181

182

183

184

185

186

187

188

189

190

191

192

193

194

195

196

197

198

213

214

215

216

217

218

219

222

Because the stored energy density of any material must be positive, the stiffness matrix is constrained to be definite positive.<sup>5</sup> A transverse isotropic material requires the positivity of  $c_{44}$ ,  $c_{66}$ , and

$$c^2 = c_{33}(c_{11} - c_{66}) - c_{13}^2.$$
 (5)

Stability constrains imposed a limited range of variations for elastic constants.<sup>10</sup> In Fig. 3, bounds of allowable values of  $c_{13}^2$  are plotted in the dimensionless diagram,

$$b = \frac{2c_{13}^2}{\left(c_{11} + c_{12}\right)^2} \text{ versus } a = \frac{c_{33}}{c_{11} + c_{12}}.$$
 (6)

199 For transverse isotropic materials the stability condition 200 [Eq. (5)] requires that  $0 \le b \le a$ . Symbols correspond to var-201 ious crystals (Be, BeO, ZnO, CdS, Ti) of hexagonal symme-202 try and to soft solids like muscles and tendons. Crystal data 203 are close to the dotted curve  $b = 2(1-a)^2$  corresponding to 204 an isotropic material  $(c_{33} = c_{11}, c_{13} = c_{12})$  of Poisson's ratio 205 v = 1 - a. With v = 0.5, a fluid or a soft solid, like isotropic 206 tissues, lies at the intersection with the line b = a. Representative points for muscles and tendons are far from the curve 208 of isotropy and border the upper limit of the diagram. This 209 representation exhibits the specific behavior of muscles and 210 tendons as compared with that of transverse isotropic solids 211 and soft isotropic tissues. 212

Since  $c^2$  vanishes for b = a, this quantity plays an important role for characterizing the behavior of a soft material. It intervenes in the Young's modulus, defined as the ratio of the loading stress to the corresponding strain. For a stress parallel to the fiber axis, the Young's modulus  $E_{//} = E_{33}$  is equal to,



237 FIG. 3. (Color online) Bounds of allowable values of  $c_{13}^2$  and data plotted for a variety of transverse isotropic crystals: Be ( $\triangle$ ), BeO ( $\blacktriangle$ ), Ti ( $\Box$ ), ZnO 238 (•), CdS ( $\blacksquare$ ), muscle (\*), and tendon ( $\blacklozenge$ ). *a* and *b* are defined from Eq. (6). 239 The dotted curve is for an isotropic medium of Poisson's ratio v = 1 - a. 240

236

301 302

303

304

309

310

311

312

313

314

315

316

317

318

319

320

321

322

323

324

325

326

327

328

329

334

335

336

337

338

339

$$E_{//} = \frac{1}{s_{33}} = \frac{c^2}{c_{11} - c_{66}}.$$
(7)

For a stress perpendicular to the fiber axis, the Young's modulus  $E_{\perp} = E_{11} = E_{22}$  is given by

$$E_{\perp} = \frac{1}{s_{11}} = \frac{4c_{66}c^2}{c^2 + c_{33}c_{66}}.$$
(8)

As pointed out by Hoffmeister, Eqs. (7) and (8) show that parallel and perpendicular Young's modulus do not depend on  $c_{44}$ , while variations in  $c_{66}$  produce changes in Young's modulus at all angles with respect to the fiber axis.<sup>2</sup>

Experimental values of  $E_{//}$  are less than 100 kPa for muscle and less than 1 MPa for tendon.<sup>3</sup> From Eq. (7), the quantity  $c^2 = E_{1/2}(c_{11} - c_{66})$  is of the order of  $10^{-3}$  (GPa)<sup>2</sup>, i.e., three orders of magnitude lower than each term of the difference in Eq. (5). Then, the equality,

$$c_{13} \cong \sqrt{c_{33}(c_{11} - c_{66})},$$
 (9)

is valid with an error less than 0.1%. The determination of  $c_{13}$  requires measurements of the phase velocity of longitudinal waves propagating in any direction in a meridian plane such as  $(x_1, x_3)$ . Equation (9) allows us to calculate  $c_{13}$  with stiffness constants deduced from sound velocity measurements only in directions parallel and perpendicular to the fiber axis. We have used results found in the literature for fresh bovine Achilles tendons to check the validity of Eq. (9). The first four columns in Table I list the mean values of stiffness constants obtained by Kuo et al. at three strain conditions, 0%, 4.7%, and 9.5%.3 The last column shows that the values of the constant  $c_{13}$  deduced from Eq. (9) are very close to the experimental ones.

Recently, experiments performed in vivo with the SSI technique show that shear wave velocities perpendicular to the fiber axis of skeletal muscles are of the order of 10 m/s.<sup>9</sup> Then, the corresponding elastic constants  $c_{66}$  and  $c_{44}$  are less than 100 kPa and Eq. (9) can be written in a form identical to that postulated by Levinson,

$$c_{13} \cong \sqrt{c_{11}c_{33}}.$$
 (10)

We have used the experimental results obtained by this author to check the validity of this formula. In Table II, the first three columns list the mean values of stiffness constants obtained for the first specimen in both passive and active phase.<sup>1</sup> The last column shows that the values of the constant  $c_{13}$  deduced from Eq. (10) are very close to the experimental

Table 1. Comparison between mean values of stiffness constant  $c_{13}$  measured (Ref. 3) and calculated from Eq. (9) (GPa) for bovine Achilles tendons at three strain conditions.

Strain	$c_{11}$	<i>c</i> <sub>33</sub>	C <sub>66</sub>	<i>c</i> <sup>13</sup> (meas.)	c <sub>13</sub> [Eq. (9)]
0%	2.93	3.90	0.61	3.00	3.01
4.7%	2.91	3.59	0.25	3.08	3.09
9.5%	2.89	3.32	0.26	2.96	2.95

Table 2. Comparison between average values (GPa) of stiffness constant  $c_{13}$  measured (Ref. 1) and calculated from Eq. (10) for a frog sartorius muscle in the passive and active phases.

Phase	$c_{11}$	c <sub>33</sub>	<i>c</i> <sub>13</sub> (meas.)	<i>c</i> <sub>13</sub> [Eq. (10)]
Active	2.60	4.17	3.29	3.29
Passive	2.60	4.46	3.40	3.41

ones. The agreement for other specimens is also very satisfactory.

The main objective of elastographic technique is to estimate the Young's modulus E of soft tissues through measurements of the shear wave velocity  $V_S$ . For an isotropic elastic media, this parameter is linked to the Lamé constants  $\lambda$  and  $\mu$ ,

$$E = \frac{\mu(3\lambda + 2\mu)}{\lambda + \mu}.$$
(11)

In soft media,  $\lambda$  is 10<sup>5</sup> times larger than  $\mu$ . Thus such medium are considered as quasi-incompressible and the very good approximation,

$$E \cong 3\mu = 3\rho V_S^2,\tag{12}$$

allows us to determine accurately the elasticity from shear wave velocity measurements.<sup>6</sup>

330 The elasticity of transverse isotropic media is described by the two Young's modulus  $E_{//}$  and  $E_{\perp}$  according to the 331 332 direction of the applied stress with respect to the fiber axis. Combining Eqs. (7) and (8) leads to 333

$$E_{\perp} = \frac{4c_{66}}{E_{//}} + \gamma c_{66} E_{//}, \tag{13}$$

where the coefficient,

$$y = \frac{c_{33}}{c_{11} - c_{66}} = 2a, \tag{14}$$

342 is equal to unity for a soft isotropic medium ( $c_{11} = c_{33}$ 343  $\gg \gamma c_{66}$ ). In this case,  $E_{//} = E_{\perp} = E$  and Eq. (13) gives 344  $E = 3c_{66} = 3\mu$ , as expected. For transverse isotropic media 345 such as tendons or muscles,  $c_{33}$  is larger than  $c_{11}$ . However, 346 values of stiffness constants in Tables I and II and data in 347 Fig. 3 show that  $\gamma = 2a$  does not exceed 2. Thus, the perpen-348 dicular Young's modulus lies in between  $3c_{66}$  and  $4c_{66}$ . The 349 lower limit corresponds to the isotropic case. The upper limit 350 corresponds to a transverse isotropic soft medium having a 351 longitudinal elasticity  $E_{//}$  much larger than the shear elastic-352 ity measured by the coefficient  $c_{66} = \mu_{\perp}$ , 353

$$3\mu_{\perp} \le E_{\perp} \le 4\mu_{\perp}.$$
 (15)  $\frac{354}{355}$ 

356 This approximation is valid for muscles, for which  $E_{//}$ 357  $\cong$  100 kPa and  $c_{66} \le$  10 kPa, with  $V_{S1}$  in between 1 and 3 358 m/s, as measured by Gennisson et al.<sup>9</sup> Thus the measure-359 ment of the shear elastic constant  $c_{66}$  provides a good 360

J. Acoust. Soc. Am., Vol. 129, No. 4, April 2011

Royer et al.: Letters to the Editor 3

Page: 4 Total Pages: 5

approximation of the Young's modulus in the direction perpendicular to the fiber axis.

As pointed out by Hoffmeister, the Young's modulus  $E_{//}$  cannot be estimated from the shear elastic constant  $c_{44}$ . Equation (7) shows that  $E_{//}$  is proportional to  $c^2$ . For a soft transverse isotropic media, we have shown that this quantity is the difference of two terms,  $c_{33}(c_{11} - c_{66})$  and  $c_{13}^2$ , that nearly compensate. Taking into account the accuracy of ultrasonic techniques, the relative error on the value of  $c^2$  is very large and the estimation of the Young's modulus parallel to the fiber failed. This remark explains the discrepancy observed by Kuo et al. between the experimental and the estimated values of  $E_{//}$ . For the unstrained tendon ( $S_0$ ), the measured Young's modulus is one order of magnitude larger than that estimated from elastic constants. This ratio is only twice for the sample with an initial strain state at 9.5%. At a higher strain the tendon becomes harder and the quantity  $c^2$  increases significantly. Thus, the estimation of the Young's modulus becomes more accurate, as noted by Kuo et al.

## III. DISCUSSION

361

362

363

364

365

366

367

368

369

370

371

372

373

374

375

376

377

378

379

380

381

382

383

384 In this paper, relationships are derived from theoretical 385 considerations and experimental results obtained by TE or SSI techniques applied to transverse isotropic soft tissues. 386 387 Relationships [Eqs. (9) and (10)] between elastic constants 388  $c_{11}, c_{13}, c_{33}$ , and  $c_{66}$  were verified on data reported in the lit-389 erature for muscles and tendons. Moreover, it is shown that 390 the well-known approximation  $E \cong 3\mu = 3\rho V_s^2$  is no more valid in the case of transverse isotropic soft tissues. In that 391 way, such medium in TE or SSI techniques must be prefer-392 393 entially defined in terms of shear velocities than in terms of 394 Young's moduli.

A representation in the stability diagram of transverse 395 396 isotropic media shows that the mechanical behavior of 397 muscles and tendons is very different from that of hexagonal crystals and also from that of isotropic tissues. One reason of 398 399 this unusual behavior of transverse isotropic tissues is the difference of anisotropy according to the type of elastic 400 waves. Regarding the speed of ultrasound wave, the ratio of 401 402 anisotropy is quite close to unity for longitudinal waves. The 403 anisotropy of soft tissues is mainly related to the shear pa-404 rameters governing the speed of slow transverse waves. This 405 explains why the anisotropy was not very well studied in the 406 last decades in ultrasonography. Moreover, expressions of the Young's modulus were derived from the relationship on 407

421 components of the elastic tensor. Young's modulus perpen-422 dicular to the fiber axis was found to be in between  $3c_{66}$  and 423  $4c_{66}$ . Thus, this parameter can be estimated from the mea-424 surement of the speed of the shear wave perpendicular to the 425 axis of symmetry. Conversely, Young's modulus parallel to 426 the fiber axis cannot be expressed in terms of shear wave 427 speed. Moreover the estimation of  $E_{//}$  from stiffness con-428 stants determined by ultrasonic measurements is very uncer-429 tain. Under these conditions, the level of anisotropy defined 430 by the ratio of the shear velocities is a quite good interpreta-431 tion and Young's moduli are not pertinent parameters. For 432 example, when a muscle is contracting, everybody feels an 433 increase of stiffness. However, as pointed out in Refs. 9 and 434 11, the shear modulus parallel to the fibers axis  $(c_{44})$ 435 increases much stronger than the shear modulus perpendicu-436 lar to the fibers axis  $(c_{66})$  with the muscle contraction. The 437 relationship between parallel Young's modulus and trans-438 verse stiffness  $(c_{66})$  commonly felt by physicians during pal-439 pation remains an open question. 440

- <sup>1</sup>S. F. Levinson, "Ultrasound propagation in anisotropic soft tissues: The application of linear elastic theory," J. Biomech. **20**(3), 251–260 (1987).
- <sup>2</sup>B. K. Hoffmeister, S. M. Handley, S. A. Wickline, and J. G. Miller, "Ultrasonic determination of the anisotropy of Young's modulus of fixed tendon and fixed myocardium," J. Acoust. Soc. Am. **100**(6), 3933–3940 (1996).
- <sup>3</sup>P. L. Kuo, P. C. Li, and M. L. Li, "Elastic properties of tendon measured by two different approaches," Ultrasound Med. Biol. 27(9), 1275–1284 (2001).
   <sup>4</sup>H. S. Yoon and J. L. Katz, "Ultrasonic wave propagation in human cortical bone. I. Theoretical considerations for hexagonal symmetry," J. Biomech. 9, 407–412 (1976).
- <sup>5</sup>D. Royer and E. Dieulesaint, *Elastic Waves in Solids. I. Free and Guided Propagation* (Springer, Berlin, 1999), Chap. 4.
- <sup>6</sup>L. Sandrin, M. Tanter, J. L. Gennisson, S. Catheline, and M. Fink, "Shear elasticity probe for soft tissue with 1D transient elastography," IEEE Trans. Ultrason. Ferroelectr. Freq. Control **49**(4), 436–446 (2002).
- <sup>7</sup>J. L. Gennisson, S. Catheline, S. Chaffaï, and M. Fink, "Transient elastography in anisotropic medium: Application to the measurement of slow and fast shear waves velocities in muscles," J. Acoust. Soc. Am. **114**(1), 536– 541 (2003).
- <sup>8</sup>J. Bercoff, M. Tanter, and M. Fink, "Supersonic shear imaging: A new technique for soft tissues elasticity mapping," IEEE Trans. Ultrason. Ferroelectr. Freq. Control **51**(4), 396–409 (2004).
- <sup>9</sup>J. L. Gennisson, T. Deffieux, E. Macé, G. Montaldo, M. Fink, and M. Tanter, "Viscoelastic and anisotropic mechanical properties of in vivo muscle tissue assessed by Supersonic Shear Imaging," Ultrasound Med. Biol. **36**(5), 789–801 (2010).
- <sup>10</sup>A. Ballato, "Poisson's ratio of auxetic and other technological materials," IEEE Trans. Ultrason. Ferroelectr. Freq. Control **57**(1), 7–15 (2010).
- <sup>11</sup>S. Levinson, S. Catheline, and M. Fink, "Anisotropy elasticity and viscosity deduced from supersonic shear imaging in muscle," in *International Society of Biomechanics, XXth Congress, 29th Annual Meeting of the American Society of Biomechanics*, Cleveland, OH (2005), p. 101.
- 444 445 446 447 448 449 450 451 452 453 454 455 456 457 458 459 460 461 462 463 464 465 466 467 468 469 470 471

472

473

474

475

476

477

478

479

480

441

442

- 412413414
- 415

408

409

410

411

- 416
- 417
- 418 419
- 420

AQ1: Letters to the Editor are restricted to 4 pages. Note the changes made to your paper so that it fits the 4-page limit.